

# Relationship Marketing and Customer Loyalty: Evidence from Banking Sector in Pakistan

Mudassir Husnain<sup>1</sup> and Waheed Akhtar<sup>2</sup>

<sup>1</sup> International Islamic University Islamabad

*Received: 12 February 2015 Accepted: 1 March 2015 Published: 15 March 2015*

---

## Abstract

The purpose of this study is to provide an insight into the impact of relationship marketing strategy on customer loyalty of retail bank sector in Pakistan and to examine whether these relationships strengthen through improvements in banking relationships. A questionnaire derived from previous studies and relevant literature was completed by 100 university students having accounts in different banks and Convenience sampling used. Multiple regression analysis assessed the impact on customer loyalty of four key constructs of relationship marketing (Trust, Commitment, Communication and conflict handling). Results indicate that four variables have significant effect and predict good proportion of variance in customer loyalty. It is reasonable to conclude, on this evidence, that customer loyalty can be created, reinforced and retained by marketing plans aimed at building trust, demonstrating commitment to service, communicating with customers in a timely, reliable and proactive fashion, and handling conflict efficiently.

---

*Index terms*— relationship marketing, customer loyalty, banks, Pakistan.

## 1 Introduction

The term relationship marketing is first used by Berry (1983), after which Jackson (1985) indulges this concept in business-to-business context. After the introduction of middleman in the supply chain, relations with the customers were given less attention (Sheth & Parvatiyar, 1995a). Arndt (1979) found that less importance is given to relationships in running businesses. Evitt (1983) used a wedding analogy and states that it all depends on the seller and how he managed the relations. These unreliable concepts have developed, and to some degree have turned into two formal modern expressions “networking” and “relationship marketing”. Relationship marketing now becomes an interesting subject area for researchers. Today in a fast-paced global environment more competition requires more performance which pinpoints the need to develop strong relationships. Ndubisi (2004) says that now firms are striving for more firm-customer relationships to gain competitive advantage to serve and keep customers away from competitors. Definitely this customer relationship reaps rewards for both buyer and seller (Rapp & Collins, 1990). So it is important to investigate the influence of relationship marketing on customer loyalty in actual conditions from different cultural perspectives like Pakistan, by considering four dimensions of relationship marketing: commitment, trust, conflict handling and communication on customer loyalty in Pakistan. Palmer (1997) has stated that:

“Relationship marketing means different things in different cultures and marketers should be as wary of prescribing universal solutions for exchange bases as they are of developing universal product and promotion for all markets” (pp. 98-106).

The banking sector of Pakistan has remained flexible and strong throughout the financial crisis in 2008-2009, a period in which a considerable amount of FDI was invested in this sector. In 2008, figures point out that the large banks are comparatively healthy. This sector twisted profit in 2002. Their profits sustained to rise for further five years and pointed to Rs 84.1 billion in 2006. Now again, business viewpoint is shifting towards relationship marketing

again in different context and this is we want to study in Pakistan perspective. The relation creates additional advantage for both buyer and supplier (Ravald & Grönroos, 1996; Grönroos, 2000). Previously, marketing practitioners emphasizes on attracting new customers rather than to retaining them (Schneider, 1980).

Marketing practitioners around the globe are agree that acquiring the new customers alone are not more fruitful for long term success, but to keep current customer ensure long term success. Building and sustaining loyal customer base is of paramount significance to firms (Kandampully & Duddy, 1999). Relationship marketing now becomes means for firms to develop and maintain mutually satisfying long term collaborative relationship (Ravald & Grönroos, 1996). When customer get deeply in company's offerings then relationship marketing work starts (O'Malley & Tynan, 2000). Customer's positive feelings and attitude can be promoted through quick flow of information between bank and customers that leads towards more satisfaction and strengthen relationships (Barnes & Howlett, 1998; New & Binks, 1996). Relationship marketing not necessarily be done towards all the bank customers because retail banks prefers more profitable customers to entertain (Carson et al., 2004; Zeithaml et al., 2001). Treating all customers in similar way across all the segments may not give similar returns (Zeithaml et al., 2001), so often, relationship marketing emphasizing only on most profitable customers having more income and contribute to fixed cost (Abratt & Russell, 1999).

Customer loyalty considered as backbone for firms as it is way for sustaining and increasing sales. As well as it plays important role for increasing profits, as it is obvious from previous researches the cost of obtaining new customers is much higher than to serve current customers (Reichheld & Sasser, 1990). These customers spread positive word of mouth about service providers and suggest it to other prospects as well. With the invention of new technologies and computerized networks led changes in banking sector which reduced transaction cost and increase the speed of service level, but on the other hand it also effect the buyer-supplier relations for example now they rely more on mobile calls (Ndubisi & Kahraman, 2005). These changes in equipment manipulate relationship marketing perspective and customer loyalty in banking sector. Still the buyer-supplier relationships are important to re examine .

This paper is going to explore how banking sector of Pakistan use relationship marketing as a competitive weapon to gain customer loyalty. The basic aim of this paper is to explore customer's perceptions and likings about their banks and to investigate relationship marketing exactness in its key dimensions (trust, communication, commitment, and conflict handling) for banking sector in Pakistan.

## 2 II.

### 3 Literature Review a) Relationship Marketing

So RM is focusing on maximizing profitability and customer loyalty with ambitions of providing even better services. According to Keltner (1995) states that due to relationship marketing strategies, tactics and policies in retail banking, German banks were able to

The main features for RM: all customers are unique, all activities must be directed towards existing customer satisfaction, execution of plans is based on open flow of information and firm's intentions should maximize profits through maintaining lower customer turnover and strengthens relationship with customers. Companies should put forth enough investment in building quality relationship with loyal or potentially loyal customers (Ndubisi, 2004). Previous studies covered by marketing literature on relationship marketing highlights four key dimensions as trust (Veloutsou et al., 2002; Morgan & Hunt, 1994), conflict handling (Ndubisi & Chan, 2005; Dwyer et al., 1987), commitment (Chan & Ndubisi, 2004; and sharing of business secrets or communication (Morgan & Hunt, 1994; Ndubisi & Chan, 2005; Crosby et al., 1990). This paper include four key dimensions of RM namely as (trust, commitment, communication and conflict handling) as these are mostly considered by academicians in past researches to check their impact on customer loyalty. All these key dimensions are linked to customer loyalty in this study.

### 4 b) Trust

Trust is another good predictor of loyalty (Reichheld et al., 2000). Trust theory has been considered in a number of disciplines and a variety of definitions have been suggested (Lewicki et al., 1998).

Trust can be described as a faith or assurance regarding to second party's intention inside the bond (association). In RM perspective, trust is define, the aspect of business relationship that establish the level to which each party believe and they can rely on the honesty of the promise offered by the other (Callaghan et al., 1995). Also it is a vital element of business relationships, and recognized as a major construct in modeling RM (Morgan & Hunt, 1994). In general it shows that the high degree of trust among buyer and supplier, In past relationship marketing at first imagined as a marketing strategy in inter-organizational and service state of affairs in different environment and arrangements (Berry, 1983; Ford, 1997; Jakansson, 1982). Since 1980's relationship marketing becomes get popularity and considered as collaborative approach rather than traditional arms length relationship, especially in service industry that were more relational focused previously (Sheth & Parvatiyar, 2000; Berry, 1983; Grönroos, 1994; Dwyer et al., 1987; Gummesson, 1994). As by Gruen (1997) and Grönroos (1989) the entire picture of business perspective has moved from production to a promotion orientation, and to "marketing" orientation which is the most basic marketing conception on which ground of marketing is stand, and after that to a societal direction. Walsh et al. (2004) defines in banking RM is "the activities carried

---

104 out by banks in order to attract, interact with, and retain more profitable or high net-worth customers.”p.  
105 469). stable themselves as compare to American banks during 1980’s and 1990’s. To be effective, RM strategies  
106 should promote and ensure perceived benefits to engage in interactions (O’Malley & Tynan, 2000). There is  
107 tendency that most of the customers do not move towards relationships, so in retail banking close relationship  
108 with customers are rare, and furthermore they becomes low as customer use more self-service equipments (O’  
109 ??oughlin et al., 2004). A Rapp & Collins (1990) state that objective is to create, sustain and develop long term  
110 mutually satisfying relationships that are beneficial for both buyer and seller. This strong relationship ultimate  
111 results customer loyalty which is defined by Oliver (1999) as a ”deeply held commitment to re-buy or re-patronize  
112 a preferred product or service in the future despite there are situational influence and marketing efforts having  
113 the potential to cause switching behavior”. 1993). In this contextual study, trust refers to customer\_supplier  
114 relationships. Customers are less likely to be a loyal to those firms who not keen to trust in a marketplace.  
115 Gronroos (1990) emphasized that the assets of the seller -human resources, equipment and arrangements utilized  
116 in such manner that the customer’s trust in the resources implicated and, therefore, in firm it is sustained  
117 and make stronger. The significance of trust in describing customer loyalty is supported by many authors e.g.  
118 (Garbarino & Johnson, 1999), (Lim et al., 1997), ??Singh & Sirdeshmukh, 2000), (Chaudhuri &Holbrook, 2001  
119 and ??Sirdeshmukh et al., 2002). As evident from previous studies, we can say that in considering loyalty the  
120 benevolence element of trust is strong in B2C context. We argue it first, because loyalty is important and has  
121 given credence element in many service markets. Secondly trust is of critical importance because (especially in  
122 strong mature relationship such as retail banking). We assumed in our model that if customer trust is increase  
123 then have direct positive effect on customer loyalty.

## 124 5 c) Commitment

125 The literature on relationship marketing is familiar with another possible antecedent of customer loyalty, which  
126 is relationship commitment (Morgan & Hunt, 1994; ??endapudi & Berry, 1997).

127 Based on literature of organizational behavior (Meyer & Allen, 1997), commitment is defined in different ways  
128 like as an aspiration to sustain a relationship (Morgan & Hunt, 1994; Deshpandé, Moorman, & Zaltman, 1993),  
129 an undertaking of bondamong parties (Dwyer, Schurr, & Oh 1987),the give up or sacrifice if a relationship split  
130 ??Anderson & Weitz, 1992), and with the lack of viable or attracting offerings (Gundlach, Achrol, & Mentzer,  
131 1995).Due to these varieties of basis generate ”stickiness” that stickiness sustains customers loyal to firm.

132 Previous literature and many other definitions highlight two key dimensions of commitment: calculative and  
133 affective commitment ??Hansen,

## 134 6 d) Communication

135 Sales and communication are essential elements of transaction marketing. We have to adjust the customer’s  
136 communication desires or needs and start on the communication cycle all over again. This is actually RM is at its  
137 best” (Schultz et al., 1992). Morgan & Hunt (1994)found that trust exist due to communication and with shared  
138 values. In retail banking, communication mean as done through letters, mail, interactions on websites and other  
139 machine related interactions and even personal interactions with personnel’s who provide service after, before  
140 and during transactions. If these communications are appropriate, supportive, positive, valuable, simple, and  
141 pleasing then it consider as ”good”. In short customers can personally benefits by interpreting the communication  
142 if information offers by the service provider is in proper manner. It is valuable specially when delivered in person  
143 to person arrangements. Good communication has positive impact on customer satisfaction, loyalty and trust. In  
144 relationship marketing perspective marketing communication is an effort to develop a two-way or sometimes even a  
145 multi-way communication procedure. All activities are not directly two-way communication but communication  
146 efforts should result to a response of some nature that continue and develop the interaction. If relationship  
147 marketing is to be effective, there should be an alignment among all marketing communication messages is  
148 required for continuance and improvements of long term mutually satisfying relationships with customers and  
149 stakeholders.

## 150 7 e) Conflict handling

151 Conflict in our lives is obvious. In general conflict is considered as a harmful, destructive experience by people,  
152 but it is more natural and invasive phenomenon in their understanding (Boonsathorn, 2007).Conflict can be  
153 healthy and normal in an organizational perspective, lack of tension is ultimately dull and stagnant and unlikely  
154 to foster creativity and growth. Putnam & Poole (1987) consider conflict from the communicational point of  
155 view. Communication is viewed as one of the five elements of ”conflict situations”. Customer interactions of  
156 service providers with their customers contain complaint handling as an integral part. It poses negative impact  
157 on credibility and on trust of service provider if viewed by customer as inappropriate and slow handling of  
158 complaints (Ganesan, 1994).Conflict handling was described by Dwyer et al.(1987) as the firm’s capability to  
159 reduce the harmful outcomes of apparent and possible conflicts.

## 160 8 Global Journal of Management and Business Research

161 Volume XV Issue X Version I Year 2015

### 9 (E)

162

163 Relationship Marketing and Customer Loyalty: Evidence from Banking Sector in Pakistan Conflicts handling  
164 depicts the supplier's capability to keep away from possible clashes, resolve apparent conflicts before they generate  
165 troubles and the ability to talk about frankly, clarification as problems occur. How conflicts are resolved will make  
166 sure loyalty, leave or say. Rusbult et al. (1988) said, chances that a person will connected in such behaviors  
167 based on the level of preceding satisfaction with the relationship, the degree of the person's involvement in the  
168 relationship and an assessment of the choices one has. Once conflict is known, accepted, as well as managed  
169 in an appropriate approach, organizational and personal benefits will end result (Silverthorne, 2005). So proper  
170 handling of conflict can contribute to loyalty.

### 10 f) Customer loyalty

171

172 Marketers considered customer loyalty vital because of its positive result on long-term success and profitability.  
173 Academic literature contains considerable discussions over loyalty's definition and dimensions or parallel concepts  
174 like commitment e.g. (Gundlach et al., 1995; Oliver, 1999; Bennett & Rundle-Thiele, 2002; Buttle & Burton,  
175 2002; Dick & Basu, 1994). For example, commitment has been defined as aspirations to go on with a relationship  
176 with motivation to works towards continuation and hope that the relationship will maintain (Anderson & Weitz,  
177 1989; Wilson, 1995). Parallel definitions exist for loyalty that are based in behavioral and attitude intentions,  
178 still much of the work on loyalty focus it in behavioral conditions (purchase regularity and repurchase) and later  
179 on admitted an attitudinal element (Jacoby & Chestnut, 1978).

180 After that advancement continues on customer loyalty and is significant in banking sector. Ganesh et al.  
181 (2000) establish two items as active loyalty (spreading word of mouth) and passive loyalty (not leaving even in  
182 less favorable situations) in loyalty items. Loyalty considered as process rather than outcome according to some  
183 authors. Oliver (1997) differentiates between four phases of loyalty which includes cognitive, affective, conative,  
184 and action. Obviously loyalty is a deep concept with many possible definitions. Behavioral loyalty means sales that  
185 are why it is very much appreciated. Behavioral and attitudinal loyalty is highly correlated (repetitive purchases  
186 direct to positive attitude), which moves to (conative loyalty: high levels of involvement and intention to keep on  
187 repurchase) so attitudinal is also highly appreciated too. Customers having strong attitudinal loyalty are more  
188 difficult to grab by competitors to steal them away (Gundlach et al., 1995) and less search for substitute (Dick  
189 & Basu, 1994). Different aspects of customer loyalty are positively predicted by commitment like using referrals.  
190 Mutual commitment serves as a basis upon which relationships are grow (Berry & Parasuraman, 1991). We will  
191 focus on explaining loyalty with trust, commitment, communication and conflict handling. There is a considerable  
192 positive relationship between (trust, conflict handling, communication, commitment) and loyalty.

### 11 g) Research hypothesis

193

194 As we mentioned earlier, that the objective of this paper is to explore customer's perceptions and likings about  
195 their banks and to investigate relationship marketing exactness in its key dimensions (commitment, trust, conflict  
196 handling and communication,) for banking sector in Pakistan. For that purpose, research hypothesis formed as:

### 12 Research Methodology

197

198 Bank customers were the population of this study in the city of Islamabad, capital of Pakistan which is recognized  
199 as dense and ethnically diverse city (peoples with different background from all over the country are living  
200 there). We can't argue that the bank customers in this city completely represent the Pakistani sample, but  
201 we can draw up a general picture of how relationship marketing impacts on customer loyalty in banking sector.  
202 Sampling technique that was used to select respondents was convenience sampling. Respondents filled up a survey  
203 questionnaire during the period of March-April 2012. Responses were analyzed from almost 125 customers having  
204 accounts in different banks, 107 questionnaires were returned back, among them 100 were useful and response  
205 rate was 80%. A survey was used to investigate the relationship. The constructs in questionnaire presented  
206 information regarding conflict handling, trust, communication, commitment and customer loyalty. And, the basic  
207 purpose of the survey was to know that how respondents think about trust, conflict handling, communication,  
208 and commitment with their respective banks.

### 13 b) Variables measurement

209

210 Items that measure the construct dimensions in questionnaire were adapted from past researches: Bloemer et al.,  
211 (1999) for loyalty dimension (e.g. the bank that first comes to my mind when making purchases decision on bank  
212 services). (Churchill & Surprenant, 1982) for trust (e.g. the bank's promises are reliable), (Morgan & Hunt,  
213 1994) for the communication (e.g. the bank provides timely and trustworthy information), conflict handling  
214 (e.g. the bank tries to avoid potential conflict) and commitment (e.g. the bank is flexible when its services are  
215 changed) dimension. Total number of 19 questions connected to five dimensions are includes in questionnaire.  
216 Responses of all items were measured by agreement with statements, which are ranging from 1=strongly disagree  
217 to 5=strongly agree on a five-point Likert scale.

---

## 14 c) Analysis used

Different statistical tools used to analyze data; regression analysis was carried out to examine the association among the four key dimensions of RM and customer loyalty, in this perspective (Butcher et al., 2001; Wang and Wong, 2001).

## 15 IV.

## 16 Data Analysis

In this chapter we focus on analysis of data and we conducted firstly demographic results, correlation among the study variables and then regression analysis performed to investigate the effect on independent variables on dependent variable. 1 summarizes Demographic data of respondents, majority of respondents were male: 100, to 36 percent female. More than three quarters (93%) were below 40 years of age, (39%) are with their current bank for 5 years, 38 percent for between 6 and 10 years, and (19 percent) had been customers for 11-15 years or less. 51 percent among the respondents are unmarried. We calculate means and standard deviations for each variable and produced a correlation matrix of all variables used in hypothesis testing. Means, Standard deviations, reliabilities, and correlations among all scales used in the analyses are shown in Table 2. The constructs of the entire variables were tested for reliability analysis using cronbach alpha scores, and the values of cronbach alpha for all the variables (trust .899>.70), commitment (0.588), communication (.803>.70), conflict handling (.844>.70) and customer loyalty (.621<.70) were found significant at level of 0.70 which was recommended by (Nunnally, 1978) and same found in the study of (Ndubisi, 2006). After analyzing the Table 1, we can see that the correlations between customer loyalty (CL) and trust, CL and communication, and CL and conflict handling are positive correlate at 0.01 level and CL and commitment are positive correlated and significant at the 0.05 level. And we also conclude that the correlation values between all the independent variables are less than 0.80, so the chances of multi colinearity are nothing. This is satisfactory for our research intentions as well as match up positively with value calculated by (Goldsmith et al., 1999). 3 shows the regression analysis between trust, commitment, communication and conflict handling as independent variable and customer loyalty as a dependent variable.

## 17 b) Correlation

The result depicts that the relationship between trust and CL is positive and significant ( $r=0.130, p<0.05$ ). The  $r$  value of H1 (A) shows that if one unit increases in trust then customer loyalty will be increased by 13 percent. The  $p$  value is less than 0.05 so (H1A, Trust directly and positively affects customer loyalty) is accepted. Relationship between commitment and CL is positive and significant ( $r=0.645, p<0.05$ ) means one unit increase in commitment then customer loyalty will be increased by 64.5percent;(H1B, Commitment directly and positively affects customer loyalty)is accepted. Similarly, communication and CL ( $r=0.191, p<0.05$ ) and conflict handling and CL is ( $r=0.200, p<0.05$ ) these findings support (H1C, which was proposed that communication has significant and positive affect on customer loyalty) and (H1D, which was proposed that conflict handling has significant and positive affect on customer loyalty) so, H1 (C) and H1 (D) also accepted. Our findings provide the same results as with previous studies of Bansal et al. (2004) and (Hennig-Thurau et al., 2002; Dwyer et al., 1987). We computed  $R^2$  value for our model which is ( $R^2 =0.757$ ) also shows fitness of good of model. And the explanatory power of our model means that 75.7 percent of the model is explained.

V.

## 18 Discussion and Conclusion

The vast body of literature on relationship marketing is often suggesting that it is a solution in all conditions for customers where such a relationship strategy is looking suitable. This study has confirmed that measurement of the "underpinnings" of RM can forecast customer loyalty, at least in the Pakistani banking sector. For that reason, academicians and practitioners trying to care for loyal customers should pay concentration on problems regarding to trust, commitment, communication and conflict handling.

Findings entails that diverse kinds of loyalty behavior need different commitment. This recommends that tailored marketing strategies are needed. Passive loyalty leads to loyalty behavior by means of any type of commitment. On the other side, affective commitment leads to active loyalty. These results are similar with findings of (Meyer, Allen, & Smith, 1993). Our results show that to increase customer commitment, marketers in banks must make sure that customers feel safe and sound, that they see minimal risk and are happy with relationship. The social features of relationship in business not only improve relationship but also increase commitment towards firm (Goodwin & Gremler, 1996). We found as we expected that communication influenced customer loyalty supported by past studies (Dwyer et al., 1987;Hennig-Thurau et al., 2002). One important result of this study is that loyalty is described not as much by trust than predicted and much more by communication, in banking sector Pakistan. With little distinction in basic services of banks, communication may be a key tool to differentiate the bank. Useful, precise, and personalized sort of information and guidance boost satisfaction, trust and loyalty, to large extent. Pakistani bank customers expect from their banks to have knowledge about their business. Trust is a key aspect in the improvement and retention of existing relationships. (Morgan & hunt,

1994) explained that relationship commitment and trust are prerequisite of relationship marketing success and this commitment and trust further leads to cooperation. In contrast, lack of commitment in relationship means more turnover of customer and functional conflict may rise due to lack of trust. Moves towards relationship marketing will require various types of changes to old arrangements and thoughts. Considerable internal marketing is needed (Voima, 2000; Ballantyne, 1997; George, 1990; ?ro"nroos, 2000) Furthermore, the paper explores the relationship marketing approaches of Pakistani banks and to examine whether it contribute to satisfaction and developments in the bank relationship, thus increase loyalty. The desirable and profitable customer segment is small but vital to the bank. So, the banks paid special attention to the needs and desires of these customers than with other customer segment having low deposit account.

Now the concept is changed and become reverse, said by a manager who was respondent in a survey, that banks are now responsible for maintaining and developing relationship with their customers due to customer oriented strategy, whereas previously this was up to the customer. Due to continuous interaction with customers and sophisticated information system banks are now able to stock up information about them for the sake of future contacts. This is all because of deposits, high volumes of loans, and investments. It is also important to discuss that profitable customer wants to be conscious of their significance to the bank, and they don't compromise for anything less than excellent service.

### 19 a) Implications

Theoretically, this study provides empirical support for influence on customer loyalty based on four key factors of RM: communication, conflict handling, commitment and trust. This strengthens the existing literature value by relating list of factors to customer loyalty with empirical support. This paper provides value to existing body of literature by empirically connecting further wide-ranging list of determinants to the customer loyalty. It based on previous work in this field, which had either examined an unfinished listing of possible underpinnings ??Wong & Sohal, 2002; Ndubisi, 2004) Additionally, branch manager shave to continuously balance among services to fresh customers and spend in RM to keep current customers, with low funds (Carson et al., 2004). Moreover, banks should striving towards selected customer who contributed most to fixed cost and retain them. As by ??Payne & Frow, 2005), RM involves a series of routes, which required being aligned within the banks, if the bank wants to succeed.

Banks aspirations are to keep and grow loyal customers should be truthful, reliable and commit to the service norms, should talk well-timed and exactly, and must resolve clashes or conflict in a way that will remove loss and trouble to customers. It has been recommended by (Ndubisi, 2004) that loyal and satisfied customers are important communicators of positive word-of-mouth regarding firms or their brands to which they believe faithful. Furthermore, they can contribute in a way, by giving new customers to organization and loyal customers can also provide as helpful sources of innovative product ideas.

### 20 b) Limitations and Suggestions for Future researches

As mentioned earlier, bank customers were the population of this study in the city of Islamabad, capital of Pakistan which is recognized as dense and ethnically diverse city (peoples with different background from all over the country are living there). So, several limitations were found in our study that put question mark. First, this study is conducted in one city of Pakistan more studies are required that comprises more geographical areas and cross national comparison. This study focused on just one service sector, future studies may advance these efforts by examining the distinction among service types.

Secondly, relationship characteristics such as duration, strength and intensity of the relationship, socio-demographic may also provide exciting results at least. Previous studies have reported that women are more loyal as compared to men , and younger age groups are less loyal than older people. Future studies might productively consider such moderating effects. Last but not least, in order to increase validity of the study it is recommended to replicate study on larger scale with more representative sample.<sup>1</sup>

---

<sup>1</sup>© 2015 Global Journals Inc. (US)



Figure 1: Relationship

|                   |          |         |       |                |
|-------------------|----------|---------|-------|----------------|
| Strongly Disagree | Disagree | Neutral | Agree | Strongly agree |
| 1                 | 2        | 3       | 4     | 5              |

Figure 2:

|                   |          |         |       |                |
|-------------------|----------|---------|-------|----------------|
| Strongly Disagree | Disagree | Neutral | Agree | Strongly agree |
| 1                 | 2        | 3       | 4     | 5              |

20155

Figure 3: Commitment © 2015 5 Global

Sandvik, & Selnes, 2003; Fullerton 2003; Johnson et al. 2001). Calculative commitment is more economic, depend on reason rely on benefits of product (Anderson & Weitz, 1992; Dwyer, Schurr, & Oh, 1987; Heide & John, 1992). Affective commitment is hot concept, or more touching, that builds up through personal involvement of customer with a firm, which lead towards high level of trust and commitment (Morgan & Hunt, 1994; Garbarino & Johnson, 1999). In a context of services, Verhoef (2003) reveals that relationship development and relationship maintenance (retention) both are affected by affective commitment.

Figure 4:

1

|                       |    |
|-----------------------|----|
| Percent               |    |
| Age                   |    |
| 18-25                 | 52 |
| 26-35                 | 41 |
| 36-45                 | 07 |
| 46 and above          | 02 |
| Marital status        |    |
| Married               | 49 |
| Single                | 51 |
| Gender                |    |
| Male                  | 64 |
| Female                | 36 |
| Relationship strength |    |
| 1-5 years             | 39 |
| 6-10                  | 38 |
| 11-15                 | 19 |
| 16 and above          | 4  |

Figure 5: Table 1 :

Figure 6: Table

2

\*\* . Correlation is significant at the 0.01 level (2-tailed). N=100, ? values in parenthesis.

. Correlation is significant at the 0.05 level (2-tailed).

TR=Trust, COMIT=Commitment, COMMU=Communication, CH=Conflict handling, CL=Customer loyalty,

Figure 7: Table 2 :

Year 2015

6

Volume XV Issue X

Version I

E )

(

| Global Journal of<br>Management and<br>Business Research | TR | COMIT | Mean | SD   | TR        | COMIT   | COMMUCH | CL             |
|----------------------------------------------------------|----|-------|------|------|-----------|---------|---------|----------------|
|                                                          |    | CH    | 3.10 | .914 | (0.899)   | (0.588) | (0.803) | (0.844)(0.621) |
|                                                          |    | CL    | 4.01 | .525 | .120 .331 | .322 ** | .021    | .273           |
|                                                          |    |       | 3.50 | .823 | ** .244 * | -.085   | .657    | **             |
|                                                          |    |       | 3.19 | .944 | .477 **   | .238 *  | **      |                |
|                                                          |    |       | 3.45 | .903 |           |         |         |                |

© 2015

Global

Journals Inc.

(US) 1

Figure 8:

3

Figure 9: Table 3 :

| Model | B          | Unstandardized Coefficients<br>Std. Error | Standardized Coefficients<br>Beta | t      | Sig. | R <sup>2</sup> |
|-------|------------|-------------------------------------------|-----------------------------------|--------|------|----------------|
| 1     | (Constant) | .255                                      |                                   | -      | .457 |                |
|       | TR         | .127                                      | .130                              | 2.247  | .027 |                |
|       | COMIT      | .639                                      | .645                              | 10.073 | .000 | 0.757          |
|       | COMMEN     | .201                                      | .191                              | 3.123  | .002 |                |
|       | CH         | .187                                      | .200                              | 3.769  | .000 |                |

. Conflict sometimes becomes destructive or constructive. If situati

Figure 10:

---

linked them to relationship quality (Wong & Sohal, 2002) and satisfaction (Ndubisi & Chan, 2005) without considering the objective of any service provider, that build customer loyalty.

been the driving force behind RM popularity. The reason behind the popularity of this field is interest of practitioners. RM managers of banks in Pakistan can gain from a comprehensive understanding of the different factors that drive loyalty. This study proposes that incorporate performance(customer loyalty) and capability offerings (commitment)

or

Practical implications, practitioner inte

relationship marketing should  
both generate stimulation

Figure 11:



321 What is your marital status?

322 .1 3.

323 What is your Gender?

324 .2 4.

325 Relationship strength:

326 5 Point Likert scale used (strongly disagree "1" to strongly agree "5" ) Section: 2 Trust: 5. The bank is  
 327 very concerned with security for my transactions 6. The bank's promises are reliable. The bank is consistent  
 328 in providing quality service 8. Employees of the bank show respect to customers Dear Respondent! I am a  
 329 student of MS (MARKETING) at International Islamic University Islamabad. And am conducting a research on  
 330 'RELATIONSHIP MARKETING AND CUSTOMER LOYALTY". The questionnaire will be used for research  
 331 which is a part of my MS course. The objective of this questionnaire is to find out relationship between relationship  
 332 marketing and customer loyalty. It should not take more than 10 minutes to fill the questionnaire as all of questions  
 333 just require you to tick appropriate answer. Your answer will be kept strictly confidential and will only be used  
 334 for research purposes. Your name will not be mentioned any where on the document so kindly give an impartial  
 335 opinion to make research successful. You are requested to take 10 minutes out of your busy schedule to fill this  
 336 questionnaire. Your cooperation is highly appreciated. If you need findings of this research please send a request  
 337 to Mudassirhusnain@yahoo.com Thanks once again for your time and cooperation.

338 Mudassir

339 [Bennett and Rundle-Thiele ()] 'A comparison of attitudinal loyalty measurement approaches'. R Bennett , S R  
 340 Rundle-Thiele . *Journal of Brand Management* 2002. 9 (3) p. .

341 [Johnson ()] 'A Framework for Comparing Customer Satisfaction Across Individuals and Product Categories'. M  
 342 Johnson , D . *Journal of Economic Psychology* 1991. 12 (2) p. .

343 [Bansal et al. ()] 'A three-component model of customer commitment to service providers'. H S Bansal , P G  
 344 Irving , S F Taylor . *Journal of the Academy of Marketing Science* 2004. 32 (3) p. .

345 [Churchill and Surprenant ()] 'An investigation into the determinants of customer satisfaction'. G A Churchill ,  
 346 C Surprenant . *Journal of Marketing Research* 1982. 19 (4) p. .

347 [Carson et al. ()] 'Balancing transaction and relationship marketing in retail banking'. D Carson , A Gilmore ,  
 348 S Walsh . *Journal of Marketing Management* 2004. 20 (3/4) p. .

349 [Berry and Parasuraman ()] L Berry , A Parasuraman . *Marketing Services: Competing through Quality*,  
 350 (Macmillan, New York, NY) 1991.

351 [Lim and Razzaque ()] 'Brand loyalty and situational effects: An interactionist perspective'. K Lim , A M  
 352 Razzaque . *Journal of International Consumer Marketing* 1997. 9 (4) p. .

353 [Jacoby and Chestnut ()] *Brand Loyalty: Measurement and Management*, J Jacoby , R W Chestnut . 1978. New  
 354 York, NY: Wiley & Sons.

355 [Gummesson ()] 'Broadening and specifying relationship marketing'. E Gummesson . *Asia-Australia Marketing*  
 356 *Journal* 1994. 2 (1) p. .

357 [Jackson (1985)] 'Build customer relationships that last'. B B Jackson . *Harvard Business Review* 1985.  
 358 November-December, 120-8. 63.

359 [Chan and Ndubisi ()] 'Building customer loyalty in the digital age through relationship marketing (RM) and  
 360 the mediation effect of trust'. K W Chan , N O Ndubisi . *Proceedings of the 5 th International Conference on*  
 361 *Operations and Quantitative Management*, (the 5 th International Conference on Operations and Quantitative  
 362 Management Seoul, South Korea) 2004.

363 [Meyer and Natalie ()] *Commitment in the Workplace: Theory, Research and Application*, J Meyer , A Natalie  
 364 . 1997. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publications.

365 [Meyer et al. ()] 'Commitment to organizations and occupations: Extension and test of a three-component  
 366 conceptualization'. J P Meyer , N J Allen , C A Smith . *Journal of Applied Psychology* 1993. 78 (4) p.  
 367 .

368 [Gro" Nroos ()] 'Creating a relationship dialogue: communication, interaction, value'. C Gro" Nroos . *Marketing*  
 369 *Review* 2000b. 1 (1) p. .

370 [Dick and Basu ()] 'Customer loyalty: toward an integrated conceptual framework'. A Dick , K Basu . *Journal*  
 371 *of the Academy of Marketing Science* 1994. 22 (2) p. .

372 [Bendapudi and Leonard ()] 'Customers' Motivations for Maintaining Relationships with Service Providers'. N  
 373 Bendapudi , L B Leonard . *Journal of Retailing* 1997. 73 (1) p. .

374 [Groènroos ()] 'Defining marketing: a marketoriented approach'. C Groènroos . *European Journal of Marketing*  
 375 1989. 23 (1) p. .

- 376 [Palmer ( )] *Defining relationship marketing: an international perspective*, A Palmer . 1997. p. .
- 377 [Anderson and Weitz ( )] ‘Determinants of continuity in conventional industrial channel dyads’. E W Anderson ,  
378 B Weitz . *Marketing Science* 1989. 8 (4) p. .
- 379 [Ganesan ( )] ‘Determinants of long-term orientation in buyer-seller relationships’. S Ganesan . *Journal of*  
380 *Marketing* 1994. 58 (2) p. .
- 381 [Grossman ( )] ‘Developing and managing effective consumer relationships’. R P Grossman . *Journal of Product*  
382 *& Brand Management* 1998. 7 (1) p. .
- 383 [Grossman ( )] ‘Developing and managing effective consumer relationships’. R P Grossman . *Journal of Product*  
384 *& Brand Management* 1998. 7 (1) p. .
- 385 [Dwyer et al. ( )] ‘Developing buyer-seller relationships’. R F Dwyer , P H Schurr , S Oh . *Journal of Marketing*  
386 1987. 51 (2) p. .
- 387 [Callaghan et al. (1995)] ‘Dimensions of a relationship marketing orientation: an empirical exposition’. M  
388 Callaghan , J M Mcphail , O H M Yau . *Proceedings of the Seventh Biannual World Marketing Congress*  
389 1995. July. 7 (2) p. .
- 390 [Hansen et al. (2003)] ‘Direct and Indirect Effects of Commitment to a Service Employee on the Intention to  
391 Stay’. H Hansen , S Kåre , S Fred . *Journal of Service Research* 2003. May. 5 p. .
- 392 [Heide and George (1992)] ‘Do Norms Matter in Marketing Relationships?’. J Heide , J George . *Journal of*  
393 *Marketing* 1992. April. 56 p. .
- 394 [Buttle and Burton ( )] ‘Does service failure influence customer loyalty?’. F Buttle , J Burton . *Journal of*  
395 *Consumer Behaviour* 2002. 1 (3) p. .
- 396 [Berry et al.] ‘Emerging Perspectives on Services Marketing’. L L Berry , G L Shostack , Upah . *Proceedings*  
397 *Series G.D. (ed.) American Marketing Association.*
- 398 [Butcher et al. ( )] ‘Evaluative and relational influences on service loyalty’. K Butcher , B Sparks , F O’callaghan  
399 . *International Journal of Service Industry Management* 2001. 12 (4) p. .
- 400 [Ndubisi and Chan ( )] ‘Factorial and discriminant analyses of the underpinnings of relationship marketing and  
401 customer satisfaction’. N O Ndubisi , K W Chan . *International Journal of Bank Marketing* 2005. 23 (3) p. .
- 402 [Moorman et al. (1993)] ‘Factors Affecting Trust in Market Relationships’. C Moorman , D Rohit , Z Gerald .  
403 *Journal of Marketing* 1993. January. 57 p. .
- 404 [Goldsmith et al. ( )] ‘Fashion innovativeness and self-concept: a replication’. R E Goldsmith , M A Moore , P  
405 Beaudoin . *Journal of Product & Brand Management* 1999. 8 (1) p. .
- 406 [Goodwin and Gremler ( )] ‘Friendship over the counter: how social aspects of service encounters influence  
407 consumer service loyalty’. C Goodwin , D Gremler . *Advances of Services Marketing Management*, (Greenwich,  
408 CT) 1996. JAI Press.
- 409 [Gro“nroos ( )] ‘From marketing mix to relationship marketing: towards a paradigm shift in marketing’. C  
410 Gro“nroos . *Management Decision* 1994. 32 (2) p. .
- 411 [O’loughlin et al. ( )] ‘From relationships to experiences in retail financial services’. D O’loughlin , I Szmigin , P  
412 Turnbull . *International Journal of Bank Marketing* 2004. 22 (7) p. .
- 413 [George ( )] ‘Internal marketing and organizational behavior: a partnership in developing customer-conscious  
414 employees at every level’. W R George . *Journal of Business Research* 1990. 20 (1) p. .
- 415 [Ballantyne ( )] ‘Internal networks for internal marketing’. D Ballantyne . *Journal of Marketing Management*  
416 1997. 13 (5) p. .
- 417 [Bloemer et al. ( )] ‘Linking perceived service quality and service loyalty: a multi-dimensional perspectives’. J  
418 Bloemer , K De Ruyter , M Wetzels . *Journal of Marketing* 1999. 33 (4) p. .
- 419 [Martin and Sohi ( )] ‘Maintaining relationships with customers: some critical services providers and retail  
420 customers’. M C Martin , R S Sohi . *International Journal of Bank Marketing* 1993. 16 (1) p. .
- 421 [Nunnally ( )] J Nunnally , C . *Psychometric theory*, (New York) 1978. McGraw-Hill. (2nd ed.)
- 422 [Gronroos ( )] ‘Relationship approach to the marketing function in service contexts: the marketing and  
423 organizational behavior interface’. C Gronroos . *Journal of Business Research* 1990. 20 (1) p. .
- 424 [Keltner ( )] ‘Relationship banking and competitive advantage: evidence from the US and Germany’. B Keltner  
425 . *California Management Review* 1995. 37 (4) p. .
- 426 [Ndubisi ( )] ‘Relationship marketing and customer loyalty’. N O Ndubisi . *Marketing Intelligence & Planning*  
427 2006. 25 (1) p. .
- 428 [O’malley and Tynan ( )] ‘Relationship marketing in consumer markets. Rhetoric or reality?’. L O’malley , C  
429 Tynan . *European Journal of Marketing* 2000. 34 (7) p. .

- 430 [Abratt and Russell ()] *Relationship marketing in private banking in South Africa*, R Abratt , J Russell . 1999.
- 431 [Kandampully and Duddy ()] 'Relationship marketing: a concept beyond the primary relationship'. J Kan-  
432 dampully , R Duddy . *Marketing Intelligence& Planning* 1999. 17 (7) p. .
- 433 [Gruen ()] 'Relationship marketing: the route to marketing efficiency and effectiveness'. T W Gruen . *Business*  
434 *Horizons* 1997. 40 (6) p. .
- 435 [Crosby et al. ()] 'Relationship quality in services selling: An interpersonal influence perspective'. L A Crosby ,  
436 K R Evans , D Cowles . *Journal of Marketing* 1990. 54 (3) p. .
- 437 [Oliver ()] *Satisfaction: A Behavioral Perspective on the Consumer*, R Oliver . 1997a. Boston, MA:  
438 Irwin/McGraw-Hill.
- 439 [Ndubisi ()] 'Service quality: understanding customer perception and reaction, and its impact on business'. N O  
440 Ndubisi . *International Journal of Business* 2003. 5 (2) p. .
- 441 [Ndubisi et al. ()] 'Supplier selection and management strategies and manufacturing flexibility'. N O Ndubisi ,  
442 M Jantan , C H Loo , M S Ayub . *Journal of Enterprise Information Management* 2005. 18 (3) p. .
- 443 [Ndubisi and Kahraman ()] 'Teleworking adoption decision-making processes: multinational and Malaysian firms  
444 comparison'. N O Ndubisi , C Kahraman . *Journal of Enterprise InformationManagement* 2005. 18 (2) p. .
- 445 [Putnam and Poole ()] 'The bank fulfils its obligations to customers 10. I have confidence in the bank's services  
446 Section: 3 Commitment: 11. The bank makes adjustments to suit my needs. 12. The bank offers personalized  
447 services to meet customer need 13. The bank is flexible when its services are changed 14. The bank is flexible  
448 in serving my needs Section: 4 Communication: 15.The bank provides timely and trustworthy information'.  
449 L L Putnam , M S Poole . *The bank provides information when there is new banking service 17. The bank*  
450 *makes and fulfils promises*, L W Porter (ed.) 1987. 16. (Handbook of Relationship Marketing and Customer  
451 Loyalty: Evidence from Banking Sector in Pakistan 9)
- 452 [Chaudhuri and Holbrook ()] 'The chain of effects from brand trust and brand effect to brand performance: the  
453 role of brand loyalty'. A Chaudhuri , M Holbrook . *Journal of Marketing* 2001. 65 (2) p. .
- 454 [Morgan and Hunt ()] 'The commitment trust theory of relationship marketing'. R M Morgan , S D Hunt .  
455 *Journal of Marketing* 1994. 58 (3) p. .
- 456 [Garbarino and Johnson ()] 'The different roles of satisfaction, trust and commitment in customer relationships'.  
457 E Garbarino , M Johnson . *Journal of Marketing* 1999. 63 (2) p. .
- 458 [Levitt ()] *The Marketing Imagination*, T Levitt . 1983a. New York, NY: Free Press.
- 459 [Gundlach et al. ()] 'The structure of commitment in exchange'. G Gundlach , R Achrol , J Mentzer . *Journal of*  
460 *Marketing* 1995. 59 (1) p. .
- 461 [Anderson and Barton (1992)] 'The Use of Pledges to Build and Sustain Commitment in Distribution Channels'.  
462 E Anderson , W Barton . *Journal of Marketing Research* 1992. February. 29 p. .
- 463 [Arndt ()] 'Towards a concept of domesticated markets'. J Arndt . *Journal of Marketing* 1979. 43 p. .
- 464 [Lewicki et al. ()] 'Trust and distrust: new relationships and realities'. R J Lewicki , D J Mcallister , R J Bies .  
465 *Academy of Management Journal* 1998. 23 (3) p. .
- 466 [Boonsathorn ()] 'Understanding conflict management styles of Thais and Americans in multinational corpora-  
467 tions in Thailand'. W Boonsathorn . *International Journal of Conflict Management* 2007. 18 (3) p. .
- 468 [Hennig-Thurau et al. ()] 'Understanding relationship marketing outcomes: an integration of relationship bene-  
469 fits and relationship quality'. T Hennig-Thurau , K Gwinner , D Gremler . *Journal of Service Research* 2002.  
470 4 (3) p. .
- 471 [Ganesh et al. ()] 'Understanding the customer base of service providers: an examination of the differences  
472 between switchers and stayers'. J Ganesh , K Reynolds , M Arnold . *Journal of Marketing* 2000. 64 (3)  
473 p. .
- 474 [Ndubisi ()] 'Understanding the salience of cultural dimensions on relationship marketing, its underpinnings and  
475 aftermaths'. N O Ndubisi . *Cross Cultural Management* 2004. 11 (3) p. .
- 476 [Fullerton (2003)] 'When Does Commitment Lead to Loyalty?'. G Fullerton . *Journal of Service Research* 2003.  
477 May. 5 p. .
- 478 [Oliver ()] 'Whence consumer loyalty?'. R L Oliver . *Journal of Marketing* 1999. 63 p. .